

### IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

## THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,

Plaintiff and Respondent,

S161545

¥.

REGINALD WYATT,

Defendant and Appellant.

SUPREME COURT FILEN

First Appellate District, Division Two, No. A114612 Alameda County Superior Court No. C147107 The Honorable Jon Rolefson, Judge

AUG 2 6 2008

Frederick K. Priyrop Clark,

RESPONDENT'S REPLY BRIEF ON THE MERITS

EDMUND G. BROWN JR.
Attorney General of the State of California

DANE R. GILLETTE Chief Assistant Attorney General

GERALD A. ENGLER Senior Assistant Attorney General

STAN HELFMAN Supervising Deputy Attorney General

LAURENCE K. SULLIVAN Supervising Deputy Attorney General

VIOLET M. LEE Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 77144

> 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004 Telephone: (415) 703-5896 Fax: (415) 703-1234

Email: Violet.Lee@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Respondent

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	Page
SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE SUPPORTS APPELLANT'S	
CONVICTION	1
CONCLUSION	3

# **TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	Page
Cases	
People v. Chance	
(Aug. 18, 2008, S145458) Cal.4th	
2008 D.A.R. 12883	2
People v. Colantuono	
(1994) 7 Cal.4th 206	1
People v. Williams	
(2001) 26 Cal.4th 779	1, 2
Statute	
Penal Code	
§ 273ab	1

#### THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,

Plaintiff and Respondent,

S161545

V.

#### REGINALD WYATT,

Defendant and Appellant.

# SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE SUPPORTS APPELLANT'S CONVICTION

The issue in this case is whether substantial evidence supports appellant's conviction for child abuse homicide under Penal Code section 273ab. Specifically, the Court asked the parties to address whether the evidence showed appellant "was 'aware of facts that would lead a reasonable person to realize that a battery would directly, naturally and probably result from his conduct' (*People v. Williams* (2001) 26 Cal.4th 779, 788) [?]" (Order granting review, May 14, 2008.)

In our Opening Brief on the Merits, we set forth the evidence showing that appellant was aware of facts that would lead a reasonable person to realize that a battery would directly, naturally, and probably result from his conduct.

In his Answer Brief on the Merits, appellant suggests that "it would be proper for this Court to consider overruling *Williams*" and to "adopt Justice Kennard's views expressed in her dissenting opinions in *Colantuono* [*People v. Colantuono* (1994) 7 Cal.4th 206] and *Williams* . . . ." (AB at p. 25 and fn. 6.) Appellant argues that assault requires "an evil purpose or intent" (AB at p. 26) and that appellant's "play wrestling" with his child Reginald "was not done for evil or criminal purpose" (AB at p. 37). On this basis, appellant argues the

evidence was insufficient to support his conviction for child abuse homicide.

Appellant's argument that assault requires an evil intent or purpose to harm the victim has been firmly rejected by this Court. Assault is a general intent crime and "does not require a specific intent to injure the victim." (*Williams*, *supra*, 26 Cal.4th at p. 788, see *People v. Chance* (Aug. 18, 2008, S145458)

\_\_\_ Cal.4th \_\_\_\_, 2008 D.A.R. 12883.) The mental state required for assault was explained in *Williams* as follows:

[A] defendant guilty of assault must be aware of the facts that would lead a reasonable person to realize that a battery would directly, naturally and probably result from his conduct. He may not be convicted based on facts he did not know but should have known. He, however, need not be subjectively aware of the risk that a battery might occur.

(*Id.* at p. 788, footnote omitted.)

The jury heard evidence, including appellant's own statements, that he body slammed Reginald, hit him in the chest and back, dropped his knee on his back, squeezed him, and gave his head an "atomic elbow." (2 CT 241-2451.) Appellant wanted Reginald to be more active and was trying to "toughen him up." (2 CT 267.) Appellant admitted he was hitting Reginald "pretty hard." (2 CT 273.) Reginald died from blunt trauma to the chest and abdomen, injuries commonly seen in people hit by a motor vehicle. (3 RT 371, 373, 498.) Appellant obviously knew of his own conduct toward Reginald. A reasonable person would find that the force used against Reginald was likely to result in great bodily injury. Ample evidence supports appellant's conviction for child abuse homicide.

2

#### **CONCLUSION**

Accordingly, respondent respectfully requests that the judgment of the Court of Appeal be reversed.

Dated: August 25, 2008

Respectfully submitted,

EDMUND G. BROWN JR. Attorney General of the State of California

DANE R. GILLETTE Chief Assistant Attorney General

GERALD A. ENGLER Senior Assistant Attorney General

STAN HELFMAN Supervising Deputy Attorney General

LAURENCE K. SULLIVAN
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

VIOLET M. LEE

Deputy Attorney General

Attorneys for Respondent

SF2008400849 20131760.wpd

#### **DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY U.S. MAIL**

No.: **S161545** 

I declare:

I am employed in the Office of the Attorney General, which is the office of a member of the California State Bar, at which member's direction this service is made. I am 18 years of age or older and not a party to this matter. I am familiar with the business practice at the Office of the Attorney General for collection and processing of correspondence for mailing with the United States Postal Service. In accordance with that practice, correspondence placed in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General is deposited with the United States Postal Service that same day in the ordinary course of business.

On <u>August 26, 2008</u>, I served the attached **RESPONDENT'S REPLY BRIEF ON THE MERITS** by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General at 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000, San Francisco, CA 94102-7004, addressed as follows:

Waldemar Derek HalkaDeSalava Attorney at Law P.O. Box 99965 San Diego, CA 92169 (two copies)

Court of Appeal of the State of California First Appellate District, Division Two 350 McAllister Street San Francisco, CA 94102 (hand delivered) The Honorable Thomas Orloff
District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney's Office
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900
Oakland, CA 94612-4203

First District Appellate Project Attention: Executive Director 730 Harrison St., Room 201 San Francisco, CA 94107

County of Alameda Rene C. Davidson Courthouse Superior Court of California 1225 Fallon Street Oakland, CA 94612-4293

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on August 26, 2008, at San Francisco, California.

B. Wong	B.WS
Declarant	Signature

#### **DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY U.S. MAIL**

Case Name:	People v	v. Wyatt
------------	----------	----------

No.: **S161545** 

I declare:

I am employed in the Office of the Attorney General, which is the office of a member of the California State Bar, at which member's direction this service is made. I am 18 years of age or older and not a party to this matter. I am familiar with the business practice at the Office of the Attorney General for collection and processing of correspondence for mailing with the United States Postal Service. In accordance with that practice, correspondence placed in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General is deposited with the United States Postal Service that same day in the ordinary course of business.

On <u>August 26, 2008</u>, I served the attached **RESPONDENT'S REPLY BRIEF ON THE MERITS** by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the internal mail collection system at the Office of the Attorney General at 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000, San Francisco, CA 94102-7004, addressed as follows:

Waldemar Derek HalkaDeSalava Attorney at Law P.O. Box 99965 San Diego, CA 92169 (two copies)

Court of Appeal of the State of California First Appellate District, Division Two 350 McAllister Street San Francisco, CA 94102 (hand delivered) The Honorable Thomas Orloff District Attorney Alameda County District Attorney's Office 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612-4203

First District Appellate Project Attention: Executive Director 730 Harrison St., Room 201 San Francisco, CA 94107

Superior Court of California County of Alameda Rene C. Davidson Courthouse 1225 Fallon Street Oakland, CA 94612-4293

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on August 26, 2008, at San Francisco, California.

B. Wong	B. WS
Declarant	Signature