KAMALA D. HARRIS
Attorney General of California
JULIE L. GARLAND
Senior Assistant Attorney General
HOLLY D. WILKENS
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
JENNIFER A. JADOVITZ
Deputy Attorney General
State Bar No. 207004
110 West A Street, Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92101
P.O. Box 85266
San Diego, CA 92186-5266
Telephone: (619) 645-2204

SUPREME COURT FILED

JUL 15 2014

Frank A. McGuire Clerk

Deputy

In the Supreme Court of the State of California

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,

Email: Jennifer.Jadovitz@doj.ca.gov

Plaintiff and Respondent,

v.

Fax: (619) 645-2191

Attorneys for Respondent

PAUL NATHAN HENDERSON,

Defendant and Appellant.

CAPITAL CASE

Riverside County Superior Court, Case No. S098318

Appellate District, Case No. INF027515

RESPONSE TO APPELLANT'S REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE

Appellant Paul Nathan Henderson seeks judicial notice of Exhibit A to his request filed on July 1, 2014. In his request, Henderson indicates non-opposition to the motion filed in this matter by Respondent on March 20, 2013, seeking judicial notice of the autopsy report that is relevant to this Court's consideration of Appellant's Argument VIII in his pending appeal wherein he alleges a violation of the Confrontation Clause. Appellant asks

DEATH PENALTY

that in addition to the report that is the subject of Respondent's judicial notice request, this Court take judicial notice of the "entire Coroner's file" and proffers Exhibit A which consists of 33 pages. Pages 6 through 13 of Exhibit A to Henderson's request replicates the autopsy report that is the subject of the People's Judicial Notice request. Accordingly, both parties are requesting this Court take judicial notice of pages 6-13 to Exhibit A. (See, People v. Dungo (2012) 55 Cal.4th 608, 615, citing People v. Castillo (2010) 49 Cal.4th 145, 157 [a court may take judicial notice of a public record when it does not consider the record for the truth of matters stated therein]; Dixon v. Superior Court (2009) 170 Cal.App.4th 1271, 1278 [an autopsy report is a public record].) As for the remaining pages of Exhibit A, i.e., pages 1-5 and 14-33, the People oppose judicial notice. A precondition to the taking of judicial notice in either its mandatory or permissive form is that any matter to be judicially noticed must be relevant to a material issue. (People ex rel Lockyer v. Shamrock Foods Co. (2000) 24 Cal.4th 415, 422, fn. 2.) While the testifying pathologist, Dr. Cohen, reviewed the autopsy protocol and associated notes, i.e. the autopsy report prepared by Dr. Garber, the pathologist who performed the autopsy (See, XV RT 3231), there is no basis for concluding that he reviewed, let alone, relied upon any of the additional content in the "entire Coroner's file." Instead, the record shows Dr. Cohen reviewed Dr. Garber's autopsy report, Detective Wolford's police report, and photographs from the autopsy and crime scene. (See, XV RT 3231-3235.) None of the additional materials beyond the autopsy report in Exhibit A to Henderson's request are relevant to considering his Confrontation Clause challenge to Dr. Garber's trial testimony.

Additionally, while Henderson's counsel represents in the Request filed with this Court that Exhibit A is a true and correct copy of the entire Coroner's file, Henderson fails to provide a declaration or other

certification attesting to the authenticity of the documents that are the subject of Henderson's judicial notice request. The Attorney General's Office does not have a copy of the Coroner's file as it was never admitted into evidence at trial, nor is it relevant to the Confrontation issue raised in Henderson's direct appeal. Accordingly, counsel for Respondent has not verified the authenticity of pages 1 through 5 and 14 through 33 of Exhibit A to Henderson's pending request. Consequently, the People generally object to the request for judicial notice of the uncertified documents contained in pages 1-5 and 14-13¹, and specifically opposes judicial notice on relevancy grounds.

Dated: July 14, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

KAMALA D. HARRIS
Attorney General of California
JULIE L. GARLAND
Senior Assistant Attorney General
HOLLY D. WILKENS
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

JENNIFER A JADOVITZ
Deputy Attorney General
Attorneys for Respondent

SD2001XS0005 70908241.doc

¹ It is the responsibility of counsel for Henderson to ensure that documents submitted for public filing with the Court have certain "identifiers" redacted. (See, Cal. Rule of Ct., Rule 1.20 (b)(2)(3).) Unfortunately, Exhibit A to the Request for Judicial Notice includes "identifiers" that have not been redacted as required by Rule 1.20. (See, Ex. A. at pp. 14-16, 19-22.) Accordingly, Respondent respectfully requests that counsel for Henderson be required to comply with Rule 1.20 with respect to his Request for Judicial Notice.

DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY OVERNIGHT COURIER

CASE NAME:

PAUL NATHAN HENDERSON

CAPITAL CASE NO.:

S098318

I declare:

I am employed in the Office of the Attorney General, which is the office of a member of the California State Bar, at which member's direction this service is made. I am 18 years of age or older and not a party to this matter; my business address is: 110 West A Street, Suite 1100, P.O. Box 85266, San Diego, CA 92186-5266.

On <u>July 14, 2014</u>, I served the attached: RESPONSE TO APPELLANT'S REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE, by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with the FED EX, addressed as follows:

Martin H. Dodd, Esq.
Futterman Dupree Dodd Croley Maier LLP
180 Sansome Street, 17th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94104
FED EX Tracking No. 804092751237
Counsel for appellant
2 copies

Riverside County Superior Court Presiding Judge of Dept. N-3 Indop Larson Justice Center 46-200 Oasis Street Indio, CA 92591 FED EX Tracking No. 804092751248

Governor's Office, Legal Affairs Secretary State Capitol, First Floor Sacramento, CA 95814 FED EX Tracking No. 8040 9274 3695 California Appellate Project 101 Second Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, CA 94105-3672 FED EX Tracking No. 804092751260

Mary Jameson
Automatic Appeals Unit Supervisor
Supreme Court of the State of California
350 McAllister Street, 1st Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102-7303
FED EX Tracking No. 804092751259

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on <u>July 14, 2014</u>, at San Diego, California.

Claudia Chavez-Estrada

Declarant

Signature

Musicalka

SD2001XS0005

70908295.doc70908295.DOC

SUPREME COURT

AMENDED DECLARATION OF SERVICE BY OVERNIGHT COURIE ILED

CASE NAME:

PEOPLE v. PAUL NATHAN HENDERSON

CAPITAL CASE NO.: S098318

JUL 1 6 2014

I declare:

Frank A. McGuire Clerk

I am employed in the Office of the Attorney General, which is the office of a member of the California State Bar, at which member's direction this service is made. I am 18 years of age or older and not a party to this matter; my business address is: 110 West A Street, Suite 1100, P.O. Box 85266, San Diego, CA 92186-5266.

On <u>July 15, 2014</u>, I served the attached RESPONSE TO APPELLANT'S REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with the FED EX, addressed as follows:

Habeas Corpus Resource Center 303 Second Street Suite 400 South San Francisco, CA 94107 FED EX Tracking No. 8040 9275 1156 Michael R. Snedeker, Esq.
PMB 422
4110 S.E. Hawthorne Boulevard
Portland, OR 97214
FED EX Tracking No. 8040 9275 1167
Counsel for appellant
2 copies

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on <u>July 15, 2014</u>, at San Diego, California.

Claudia Chavez-Estrada

Declarant

SD2001XS0005 70909798.doc70909798.DOC Signature

DEATH PENALTY